

From: [West, Sabrina](#)
To: [Colin Grant](#)
Cc: [Angela Picco](#)
Subject: PVA paragraph
Date: Thursday, February 21, 2013 11:04:17 AM

Hi Colin,

Here, at last, is the PVA paragraph about the Nur et al paper that I've been promising you.

"The goal of the Nur *et al.* study is to evaluate the management benefits of house mouse eradication from the SE Farallon Islands. Some of their results of their model display time to extinction. However, it is important to remember that they are not calculating absolute survival probability, but relative survival probability between several management options (Nur *et al.* 2012, p. 13), as is recommended as the more reliable calculation for PVA models (Akçakaya and Raphael 1998, p. 891; Beissinger *et al.* 1998, p. 832). We interpret the predicted population trends with much more caution. The efficacy of PVAs for predicting long-term population trends and probability of extinction is widely debated in the literature (Fieberg and Ellner 2000, p. 2046; Coulson *et al.* 2001, p. 221; but see Brook *et al.* 2000, p. 836). PVAs are considered much more reliable for considering the efficacy of management options, as relative results such as management choices are less sensitive to data gaps or assumptions inherent to any statistical model (Akçakaya and Raphael 1998, p. 891; Beissinger *et al.* 1998, p. 833, Coulson *et al.* 2001, p. 221). We also note that these absolute probabilities of survival apply only to the SE Farallon Islands, and not to the entire range of the species."

This could either be supplemental to or in place of the other paragraph you had. I did purposely try to move away from talking about flaws in the model, because I was trying to stick to what we discussed on the call: trying to avoid poking too many holes in their model. I do realize that this is all somewhat technical with the discussion of absolute vs. relative survival probabilities (and might not pass the sixth grade test). But I guess I think that when discussing model results, there's no getting around that.

Please let me know if you have any questions. I'm teleworking today, so let me know if you want to talk by phone. If the paragraph looks good, I'll send you the references in a separate email.

Cheers,

Sabrina West
Listing and Recovery Division
Carlsbad Fish and Wildlife Office
6010 Hidden Valley Road, Suite 101
Carlsbad, CA 92011

(760)431-9440 ext. 375
email: sabrina_west@fws.gov

